

5B Hope Terrace EH9 2AP

Planning Application 19/06098/FUL

OBJECTION from Grange Association

31 January 2020

The Grange Association has reviewed application 19/06098/FUL and lodges this objection, taking into account the setting within the Grange Conservation Area of 5B Hope Terrace and the neighbouring properties.

We lodged an objection to the previous application 18/04514/AMC, which was granted unamended.

1. Front elevation – solid/void ratio and compatibility with the Grange Conservation Area



5B Hope Terrace: Proposed front (south) elevation 19/06098/FUL

Our principal objection to 18/04514/AMC concerned the solid-to-void ratio of the first-floor front elevation. We maintain that objection with 19/06098/FUL. While we commented previously that we have no objection in principle to a modern design, any new development must be consistent with Policy Env. 6 of the Edinburgh Local Development Plan:

“Development within a conservation area or affecting its setting will be permitted which:

- a) preserves or enhances the special character or appearance of the conservation area and is consistent with the relevant conservation area character appraisal”

The Grange Conservation Area Character Appraisal (CACA) makes specific reference to the streetscape of Hope Terrace (page 23).

In assessing compliance with Policy Env. 6, the non-statutory guidance “Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas (March 2018)” states (page 24):

“The aim should be to preserve the spatial and structural patterns of the historic fabric and the architectural features that make [the Conservation Area] significant.” “Interventions need to be compatible with the historic context, not overwhelming or imposing.”

The proposed front elevation would present an overwhelming unbroken façade of glass to the front extending over the entire first floor width. We recognise the ambition of the applicants to create a bold modern home with light open living space but the current proposals would be a shocking contrast to the typical solid-to-void ratios of neighbouring properties, including the modern villas such as No. 10 opposite. The proposed property would not demonstrate any consistency with the

villa form of the street. Although there would be screening by trees in the summer months, the internal lighting of the property would create a public screenshow that would be alien to the Conservation Area. The CACA, in describing boundary walls and streetscape (page 23), refers to “the public face of the more secluded, private architecture behind.” The current proposals would be neither secluded nor private.

We do not wish to frustrate the ambition of the applicants to create a modern inspiring villa on this site but we do request that this rare opportunity to build a property on such a precious site should be afforded the highest quality and care in architectural innovation that will allow the modern property to sit comfortably within the Conservation Area and with neighbouring properties. We maintain our position that the applicants should be asked to reconsider the solid-to-void ratio of the first-floor front elevation and to amend the proposals accordingly.

2. Overlooking to the rear (north)

There has been a material change in the proposed internal layout of the property from the scheme approved as 18/04514/AMC. That scheme placed all four bedrooms at ground floor level, with a large open-plan living area at first floor level. That first-floor living area was specifically designed to avoid overlooking to the rear, with windows placed at obtuse angles. The exception was the window to the staircase, which would have looked directly north. However, given that this would not be a window of an occupied area, this would not have created any significant overlooking problem. We understand that the original scheme was developed by the then-owners of 4 Strathearn Road, who would have been very aware of the effect of overlooking at that boundary.



As currently approved: 18/04514/AMC – North elevation (rear)

4 Strathearn Road is an exceptional property, originally occupying the whole site between Strathearn Road and Hope Terrace. The Handling Report for 17/01193/PPP (the original granting of permission in principle for the new house on Hope Terrace) noted:

“This unusual double feu contains a villa that was originally set a long way back from Hope Terrace, almost backing on to Strathearn Road, but whose [principal] elevation is south facing. The house takes advantage of its southern aspect, and the large garden benefits from its southerly aspect whilst

affording very considerable amenity to the original villa in terms of separation from the 'main' street. The Strathearn Rd elevation is clearly the rear elevation; the development of a new house within the front curtilage of the house would adversely affect the character of the original villa."



4 Strathearn Road EH9 2AH: South (principal) elevation



4 Strathearn Road EH9 2AH: Garden to south (with fence at boundary to 5B Hope Terrace)



Latest proposal: 19/06098/FUL – Rear elevation, 5B Hope Terrace EH9 2AP

The new proposal 19/06098/FUL has a different layout, with two of the four bedrooms now at first floor level, with the staircase relocated to the west wall. Bedroom 4 in particular is proposed to include a large single paned window facing directly north. The applicants' Design Statement (page 9) describes this as the master bedroom, noting that it "has a projecting bay window [] with window seat". This would look directly to the south facing windows of the principal elevation of 4 Strathearn Road, reducing privacy and amenity of the garden.

The Householder Guidance (Feb 2019) states (page 14):

People value privacy within their homes but they also value outlook - the ability to look outside, whether to gardens, streets or beyond. To achieve both, windows either have to be spaced sufficiently far apart so that it is difficult to see into a neighbouring property or windows have to be angled away from one another.

The proposals in 19/06098/FUL are incompatible with this guidance, given the acknowledged orientation of 4 Strathearn Road with its principal elevation facing south.

We request that the applicants be asked to reconsider the window arrangement of the proposed first floor north elevation and return to the arrangement with smaller windows orientated at obtuse angles to avoid overlooking. In the absence of such an amendment, we request that the application be refused.

Grange Association
31 January 2020