

GF1 20 Mortonhall Road EH9 2HW

Planning Applications 19/02541/FUL and 19/02541/LBC

COMMENT from Grange Association – Request for alteration to materials

2 July 2019

The Grange Association has reviewed applications 19/02541/FUL and 19/02541/LBC and lodges these comments in relation to both applications, requesting that the applicants be asked to reconsider the materials proposed.

Listed villa

20 Mortonhall Road is a fine B-listed villa (“Blackford Mount”), characteristic of the best features of the Grange Conservation Area. It has been sub-divided but still retains its character and is one of the more attractive features of this section of Mortonhall Road. There are modern developments opposite and other less attractive elements of the street which make this property the more precious to be protected as an example of the classical villas of the 19th century that epitomise the Grange.

Policies and non-statutory guidance

The Edinburgh Local Development Plan includes policies in relation to listed buildings and conservation areas:

Env 3:

Development within the curtilage or affecting the setting of a listed building will be permitted only if not detrimental to the architectural character, appearance or historic interest of the building, or to its setting.

Env4

Proposals to alter or extend a listed building will be permitted where:

.....

c) ... any additions are in keeping with other parts of the building.

Env 6:

Development within a conservation area or affecting its setting will be permitted which:

*a) preserves or enhances the special character or appearance of the conservation area and is **consistent with the relevant conservation area character appraisal;***

.....

*c) demonstrates high standards of design and **utilises materials appropriate to the historic environment.***

And more generally in relation to all development:

Des 12:

Planning permission will be granted for alterations and extensions to existing buildings which:

*a) in their design and form, **choice of materials** and positioning are compatible with the character of the existing building;*

.....

*c) will not be detrimental to **neighbourhood amenity and character**.*

The Grange Conservation Area Character Appraisal recommends (page 32):

“The Council’s planning guidance generally states a presumption for sandstone and other traditional, natural materials where these form the predominant palette in the surroundings of the development. High quality, innovative modern designs and materials are not precluded, but proposals must be able to demonstrate their respect for the historic character of the host building and the area. The cumulative effect of multiple developments within the same street or area should be taken into account.”

The Householder Guidance (2019) states (page 16):

“The materials to be used on an extension should normally match exactly those of the existing building. Where the existing building is constructed of stone, natural stone of the same type and colour should be used for the extension.”

Materials proposed for this extension

The materials proposed for the external finish of this extension are not appropriate for this listed villa in the conservation area. They include:

-) Aluminium windows (anthracite colour)
-) Rendered walls
-) Zinc cladding to the fascia and soffit of the proposed flat roof.

These materials will jar against the fine sandstone walls of this villa, with its white-painted timber sash windows.

We have no objection to the basic proposal, to create an extension with a footprint broadly equivalent to that of the conservatory which it replaces. Our concern is solely about the proposed materials for that extension. The materials would be inconsistent with policies Env 3, Env 4, Env 6 and Des 12 and with the non-statutory Householder Guidance.

We therefore request that the applicants be asked to reconsider the materials and modify the proposals accordingly.

Grange Association
2 July 2019